

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY OF NORTH CANTON, OHIO

IN RE:)	
)	
NORTH CANTON)	
BOARD OF CONTROL)	
MEETING)	TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
)	

Transcript of Proceedings held before North Canton Board of Control, taken by the undersigned, Shannon L. Newhall, a Registered Professional Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, at the North Canton Civic Center, 145 North Main Street, North Canton, Ohio, on Tuesday, the 14th day of February, 2023, at 10:00 a.m.

PREMIER COURT REPORTING
Canton 330.492.4221 Akron 330.928.1418
www.premierreporters.com

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES:

- Patrick DeOrio, Director of Administration
- Jina Alaback, Director of Finance
- Wayne Boyer, Director of Law
- Jennifer Cross, Administrative Assistant
- Robert Graham, PE, City Engineer

Also present:

- Brook Harless, Stark-Trumbull Area of Realtors

- - - - -

1 MR. DEORIO: All right. I'd like to call
2 to order the regular meeting of the North
3 Canton Board of Control. Today is February
4 14th -- Happy Valentine's Day -- 2023. It is
5 10:00 a.m. I'll ask Jennifer to call the
6 roll.

7 MS. CROSS: Yes. We have Patrick DeOrio.

8 MR. DEORIO: Here.

9 MS. CROSS: Jina Alaback.

10 MS. ALABACK: Here.

11 MS. CROSS: Wayne Boyer.

12 MR. BOYER: Here.

13 MS. CROSS: Stephan Wilder is absent. He
14 was unable to attend. And then also with us
15 is Robert Graham, City Engineer.

16 MR. DEORIO: And who is the guest?

17 MS. HARLESS: My name is Brook Harless.
18 I am with Stark County Trumbull Area
19 Realtors. I'm a trustee, too, but --

20 MR. DEORIO: Trustee. That's --

21 MS. HARLESS: I'm here for a different
22 capacity. I'm the government affairs
23 director. And we got an e-mail from the
24 state government affairs director in regards
25 to the short-term rentals. And she said it

1 might be on the agenda here today.

2 MR. DEORIO: We'll have a conversation
3 about that afterwards then I guess, because
4 that's not on the agenda here.

5 MS. HARLESS: Oh, okay. Well, then I'm
6 here just to watch and observe and learn,
7 because we don't have these kind of meetings
8 where I work.

9 MR. DEORIO: Let the record reflect that
10 Brook Harless is here. And she is
11 representing in a governmental capacity
12 for --

13 MS. HARLESS: Stark -- Stark Trumbull
14 Area Realtors.

15 MR. DEORIO: Very good. Okay. All
16 right. I'd like a motion to excuse Member
17 Wilder.

18 MS. ALABACK: So moved.

19 MR. DEORIO: Moved. Is there a second?

20 MR. BOYER: Second.

21 MR. DEORIO: Moved and seconded. All
22 those in favor, signify by saying "aye."

23 MR. BOYER: Aye.

24 MR. DEORIO: Aye.

25 MS. ALABACK: Aye.

1 MR. DEORIO: Opposed?

2 (No response.)

3 MR. DEORIO: Ayes have it.

4 Item 3A, approval of the minutes from the
5 January 20th, 2023 meeting. Are there any
6 additions, corrections, amendments to the
7 minutes?

8 (No response.)

9 MR. DEORIO: Seeing none, I'll entertain
10 a motion to approve as submitted.

11 MR. BOYER: So moved.

12 MR. DEORIO: Is there a second?

13 MS. ALABACK: Second.

14 MR. DEORIO: Moved and seconded. All
15 those in favor, signify by saying "aye."

16 MR. BOYER: Aye.

17 MR. DEORIO: Aye.

18 MS. ALABACK: Aye.

19 MR. DEORIO: Opposed?

20 (No response.)

21 MR. DEORIO: The minutes are adopted as
22 submitted.

23 Item 4A, new business, Wise Avenue,
24 Northeast reconstruction project. At this
25 moment, we'll let the City Engineer, Robert

1 Graham, speak to this agenda item.

2 MR. GRAHAM: Okay. Thank you,
3 Mr. DeOrio. This is a project that was in
4 our capital budget for 2023. Back in
5 September, I had conservatively put \$885,000
6 in the budget. The day before the bid -- or
7 the morning of the bid opening, last Friday,
8 February 3rd, I ran into Jina's office kind
9 of thinking, boy, I hope I got enough money,
10 with the crazy prices we have been seeing.
11 And we could be north of a million.

12 But the one thing I thought we had going
13 for us is kind of our two go-to area
14 contractors. Both told me, because we were
15 bidding it early, that there is what they
16 call the dirt crew needed work. They didn't
17 have anything right out of the gate.

18 So then we proceeded to open bids at
19 11:00 that morning on February 3rd. And the
20 bid tab is attached. We have five bidders.
21 And my \$1,050,000 estimate would have been
22 right in the middle. Northstar was our low
23 bidder at \$876,537. And right there really
24 with them, when you look at the magnitudes,
25 Superior Paving; does a lot for us.

1 Actually, they bid our first project out of
2 the gate the last four years. They were
3 \$894- and change. And then we get up over a
4 million dollars. The high bid was
5 \$1,230,000. So quite a spread.

6 Northstar does a lot of work for us each
7 and every year. That number, we don't even
8 have to go back and amend the budget with
9 Council. It's under the \$885-, which was in
10 the budget. And, obviously, Northstar does
11 great work. No findings for recovery,
12 nothing like that. It's in the packet.

13 So I would -- our engineering would
14 recommend that the Board of Control go ahead
15 and award the contract to reconstruct Wise
16 Avenue in the amount of \$876,537, award the
17 bid to Northstar.

18 MR. DEORIO: I'll open it up for general
19 questions. One that I would ask about is
20 under incidentals, maintenance of traffic.
21 And that's always fascinating to me, the wide
22 variance under that.

23 MR. GRAHAM: Uh-huh.

24 MR. DEORIO: Chagrin Valley pegged
25 traffic control at \$125,000. And Northstar

1 is at \$15,000. Superior at \$41-. Do you
2 feel that there is any cause for concern on
3 the principal of those two numbers? They
4 understand --

5 MR. GRAHAM: Yes, the maintenance traffic
6 was spelled out in the plan. And then they
7 also have to present the plan to us at the
8 pre-construction meeting. And those kind of
9 incidental numbers, especially the bottom
10 one, which is mobilization, and which is just
11 simply bringing equipment to the site, and
12 then the maintenance of traffic, those always
13 vary wildly.

14 One of the things we look at, especially
15 on mobilization, is what would call imbalance
16 bid. Let's say somebody had 100 grand for
17 mobilization. Well, if they won and they
18 bring their equipment to the site, they could
19 get \$50,000, half of it. And they are not
20 even there yet; haven't done any work. So
21 we -- a lot of times when you can kick the
22 bid out, it's called imbalanced.

23 So this doesn't cause any angst, I guess,
24 for a better word. In fact, a lot of times,
25 Northstar loses local projects with their --

1 their maintenance of traffic. They always
2 seem to put a high number. They tightened
3 that number up, and literally that won them
4 the job over Superior. So when we are out in
5 the field, they got to maintain traffic, each
6 and every house after hours in case there is
7 fire, EMS. That's all spelled out in the
8 plans. And we don't look at the number when
9 we are out in the field. When it's time to
10 put up detour signs or maintain traffic or
11 plates over driveways, they do it.

12 MR. DEORIO: Any other questions from the
13 Director of Law or Director of Finance?

14 MR. BOYER: No, sir.

15 MR. DEORIO: All right. Seeing none, I
16 would put a motion on the table to accept the
17 engineer's recommendation that the Board of
18 Control award this Wise Avenue, Northeast
19 reconstruction project in the amount of
20 \$876,537 even to Northstar Asphalt, Inc.

21 MS. ALABACK: I'll second the motion.

22 MR. DEORIO: It has been seconded. Will
23 the Clerk please call the roll?

24 MS. CROSS: We have Patrick DeOrion.

25 MR. DEORIO: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MS. CROSS: Wayne Boyer.
MR. BOYER: Yes.
MS. CROSS: Jina Alaback.
MS. ALABACK: Yes.
MR. DEORIO: Motion passes three to zero.

Being that there are no other items on the agenda for today's meeting, I would seek a motion to adjourn.

MS. ALABACK: So moved.
MR. BOYER: Second.

MR. DEORIO: Moved and seconded. All those in favor?

MR. BOYER: Aye.
MR. DEORIO: Aye.
MS. ALABACK: Aye.

MR. DEORIO: Opposed?
(No response.)

MR. DEORIO: We stand adjourned. It is 10:09 a.m.

(This proceeding adjourned at 10:09 a.m.)

ATTEST:


Patrick DeOrion,
Director of Administration

\$	Administrative [1] - 2:5 adopted [1] - 5:21 affairs [2] - 3:22, 3:24 affiliated [1] - 11:13 affixed [1] - 11:15 afterwards [2] - 4:3, 11:6 agenda [4] - 4:1, 4:4, 6:1, 10:7 ahead [1] - 7:14 Aided [1] - 11:6 Akron [1] - 1:24 ALABACK [9] - 3:10, 4:18, 4:25, 5:13, 5:18, 9:21, 10:4, 10:9, 10:15 Alaback [3] - 2:3, 3:9, 10:3 amend [1] - 7:8 amendments [1] - 5:6 amount [2] - 7:16, 9:19 angst [1] - 8:23 APPEARANCES [1] - 2:1 approval [1] - 5:4 approve [1] - 5:10 Area [1] - 2:10 area [3] - 3:18, 4:14, 6:13 asphalt [1] - 9:20 Assistant [1] - 2:5 attached [1] - 6:20 attend [1] - 3:14 ATTEST [1] - 10:23 attorney [1] - 11:11 Avenue [3] - 5:23, 7:16, 9:18 award [3] - 7:15, 7:16, 9:18 aye [2] - 4:22, 5:15 Aye [9] - 4:23, 4:24, 4:25, 5:16, 5:17, 5:18, 10:13, 10:14, 10:15 Ayes [1] - 5:3	7:14, 9:17 bottom [1] - 8:9 boy [1] - 6:9 Boyer [3] - 2:4, 3:11, 10:1 BOYER [9] - 3:12, 4:20, 4:23, 5:11, 5:16, 9:14, 10:2, 10:10, 10:13 bring [1] - 8:18 bringing [1] - 8:11 Brook [1] - 2:10 brook [2] - 3:17, 4:10 budget [4] - 6:4, 6:6, 7:8, 7:10 business [1] - 5:23	Council [1] - 7:9 counsel [1] - 11:11 County [1] - 3:18 COUNTY [1] - 11:3 COURT [1] - 1:24 court [1] - 11:13 crazy [1] - 6:10 crew [1] - 6:16 CROSS [7] - 3:7, 3:9, 3:11, 3:13, 9:24, 10:1, 10:3 Cross [1] - 2:5	F
1	100 [1] - 8:16 10:00 [2] - 1:18, 3:5 10:09 [2] - 10:19, 10:21 11:00 [1] - 6:19 145 [1] - 1:16 14th [2] - 1:17, 3:4	C	D	fact [1] - 8:24 fascinating [1] - 7:21 favor [3] - 4:22, 5:15, 10:12 February [6] - 1:17, 3:3, 6:8, 6:19, 11:15, 11:18 field [2] - 9:5, 9:9 Finance [2] - 2:3, 9:13 financially [1] - 11:11 findings [1] - 7:11 fire [1] - 9:7 firm [1] - 11:13 first [1] - 7:1 five [1] - 6:20 foregoing [2] - 11:7, 11:9 four [1] - 7:2 Friday [1] - 6:7
2	2 [1] - 11:18 2023 [5] - 1:18, 3:4, 5:5, 6:4, 11:15 2028 [1] - 11:18 20th [1] - 5:5 24th [1] - 11:15 28(D) [1] - 11:13	CANTON [2] - 1:1, 1:5 Canton [6] - 1:12, 1:16, 1:17, 1:24, 3:3, 11:15 capacity [2] - 3:22, 4:11 capital [1] - 6:4 caption [1] - 11:9 case [1] - 9:6 Center [1] - 1:16 certify [4] - 11:5, 11:8, 11:10, 11:12 Chagrin [1] - 7:24 change [1] - 7:3 City [1] - 2:6 CITY [1] - 1:1 city [2] - 3:15, 5:25 Civic [1] - 1:16 Civil [1] - 11:13 clerk [1] - 9:23 commission [1] - 11:18 commissioned [1] - 11:5 Computer [1] - 11:6 Computer-Aided [1] - 11:6 concern [1] - 8:2 conservatively [1] - 6:5 construction [1] - 8:8 contract [2] - 7:15, 11:13 contractors [1] - 6:14 CONTROL [1] - 1:5 control [1] - 7:25 Control [4] - 1:13, 3:3, 7:14, 9:18 conversation [1] - 4:2 correct [1] - 11:7 corrections [1] - 5:6	defined [1] - 11:13 DeOrio [5] - 2:2, 3:7, 6:3, 9:24, 10:24 DEORIO [29] - 3:1, 3:8, 3:16, 3:20, 4:2, 4:9, 4:15, 4:19, 4:21, 4:24, 5:1, 5:3, 5:9, 5:12, 5:14, 5:17, 5:19, 5:21, 7:18, 7:24, 9:12, 9:15, 9:22, 9:25, 10:5, 10:11, 10:14, 10:16, 10:18 detour [1] - 9:10 different [1] - 3:21 Director [5] - 2:2, 2:3, 2:4, 9:13, 10:25 director [3] - 3:23, 3:24, 9:13 dirt [1] - 6:16 dollars [1] - 7:4 done [1] - 8:20 driveways [1] - 9:11 duly [1] - 11:5	gate [2] - 6:17, 7:2 general [1] - 7:18 given [2] - 11:5, 11:7 go-to [1] - 6:13 government [2] - 3:22, 3:24 governmental [1] - 4:11 Graham [3] - 2:6, 3:15, 6:1 GRAHAM [3] - 6:2, 7:23, 8:5 grand [1] - 8:16 great [1] - 7:11 guess [2] - 4:3, 8:23 guest [1] - 3:16
3	330.492.4221 [1] - 1:24 330.928.1418 [1] - 1:24 3A [1] - 5:4 3rd [2] - 6:8, 6:19	E	e-mail [1] - 3:23 early [1] - 6:15 employee [1] - 11:11 EMS [1] - 9:7 Engineer [1] - 2:6 engineer [2] - 3:15, 5:25 engineer's [1] - 9:17 engineering [1] - 7:13 entertain [1] - 5:9 equipment [2] - 8:11, 8:18 especially [2] - 8:9, 8:14 estimate [1] - 6:21 excuse [1] - 4:16 expires [1] - 11:18	G
4	41- [1] - 8:1 4A [1] - 5:23	H	half [1] - 8:19 hand [1] - 11:14 happy [1] - 3:4 Harless [3] - 2:10, 3:17, 4:10 HARLESS [4] - 3:17, 3:21, 4:5, 4:13 held [1] - 1:12 hereby [1] - 11:5 hereunto [1] - 11:14 high [2] - 7:4, 9:2 hope [1] - 6:9 hours [1] - 9:6 house [1] - 9:6	
A	a.m [4] - 1:18, 3:5, 10:19, 10:21 absent [1] - 3:13 accept [1] - 9:16 action [1] - 11:11 additions [1] - 5:6 adjourn [1] - 10:8 adjourned [2] - 10:18, 10:21 Administration [2] - 2:2, 10:25	B		
	better [1] - 8:24 bid [8] - 6:6, 6:7, 6:20, 7:1, 7:4, 7:17, 8:16, 8:22 bidder [1] - 6:23 bidders [1] - 6:20 bidding [1] - 6:15 bids [1] - 6:18 BOARD [1] - 1:5 Board [4] - 1:13, 3:3,			

<p style="text-align: center;">I</p> <p>imbalance [1] - 8:15 imbalanced [1] - 8:22 IN [2] - 1:4, 11:14 Inc [1] - 9:20 incidental [1] - 8:9 incidentals [1] - 7:20 interested [1] - 11:11 item [3] - 5:4, 5:23, 6:1 items [1] - 10:6</p>	<p>8:10, 8:15, 8:17 moment [1] - 5:25 money [1] - 6:9 morning [2] - 6:7, 6:19 motion [6] - 4:16, 5:10, 9:16, 9:21, 10:5, 10:8 moved [7] - 4:18, 4:19, 4:21, 5:11, 5:14, 10:9, 10:11 MR [41] - 3:1, 3:8, 3:12, 3:16, 3:20, 4:2, 4:9, 4:15, 4:19, 4:20, 4:21, 4:23, 4:24, 5:1, 5:3, 5:9, 5:11, 5:12, 5:14, 5:16, 5:17, 5:19, 5:21, 6:2, 7:18, 7:23, 7:24, 8:5, 9:12, 9:14, 9:15, 9:22, 9:25, 10:2, 10:5, 10:10, 10:11, 10:13, 10:14, 10:16, 10:18 MS [20] - 3:7, 3:9, 3:10, 3:11, 3:13, 3:17, 3:21, 4:5, 4:13, 4:18, 4:25, 5:13, 5:18, 9:21, 9:24, 10:1, 10:3, 10:4, 10:9, 10:15</p>	<p>office [2] - 6:8, 11:15 OHIO [2] - 1:1, 11:2 Ohio [4] - 1:15, 1:17, 11:5, 11:15 one [4] - 6:12, 7:19, 8:10, 8:14 open [2] - 6:18, 7:18 opening [1] - 6:7 opposed [3] - 5:1, 5:19, 10:16 order [1] - 3:2 otherwise [1] - 11:11</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">R</p> <p>ran [1] - 6:8 RE [1] - 1:4 really [1] - 6:23 Realtors [1] - 2:10 realtors [2] - 3:19, 4:14 recommend [1] - 7:14 recommendation [1] - 9:17 reconstruct [1] - 7:15 reconstruction [2] - 5:24, 9:19 record [1] - 4:9 recovery [1] - 7:11 reduced [1] - 11:6 reflect [1] - 4:9 regards [1] - 3:24 Registered [2] - 1:14, 11:4 regular [1] - 3:2 relative [1] - 11:10 rentals [1] - 3:25 Reporter [2] - 1:14, 11:4 reporting [1] - 11:13 REPORTING [1] - 1:24 representing [1] - 4:11 response [4] - 5:2, 5:8, 5:20, 10:17 Robert [3] - 2:6, 3:15, 5:25 roll [2] - 3:6, 9:23 Rule [1] - 11:13</p>	<p>specified [1] - 11:9 spelled [2] - 8:6, 9:7 spread [1] - 7:5 stand [1] - 10:18 Stark [4] - 2:10, 3:18, 4:13 STARK [1] - 11:3 Stark-Trumbull [1] - 2:10 State [2] - 1:15, 11:4 state [1] - 3:24 STATE [1] - 11:2 Stenotype [1] - 11:6 Stephan [1] - 3:13 Street [1] - 1:16 submitted [2] - 5:10, 5:22 superior [2] - 8:1, 9:4 Superior [1] - 6:25</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">J</p> <p>January [1] - 5:5 Jennifer [2] - 2:5, 3:5 Jina [3] - 2:3, 3:9, 10:3 Jina's [1] - 6:8 job [1] - 9:4</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">N</p> <p>name [1] - 3:17 needed [1] - 6:16 new [1] - 5:23 Newhall [3] - 1:14, 11:4, 11:17 none [2] - 5:9, 9:15 NORTH [2] - 1:1, 1:5 north [1] - 6:11 North [5] - 1:12, 1:15, 1:16, 3:2 northeast [2] - 5:24, 9:18 Northstar [7] - 6:22, 7:6, 7:10, 7:17, 7:25, 8:25, 9:20 Notary [3] - 1:14, 11:4, 11:17 nothing [1] - 7:12 number [4] - 7:7, 9:2, 9:3, 9:8 numbers [2] - 8:3, 8:9</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">P</p> <p>packet [1] - 7:12 party [1] - 11:11 passes [1] - 10:5 Patrick [4] - 2:2, 3:7, 9:24, 10:24 paving [1] - 6:25 PE [1] - 2:6 pegged [1] - 7:24 place [1] - 11:9 plan [2] - 8:6, 8:7 plans [1] - 9:8 plates [1] - 9:11 pre [1] - 8:8 pre-construction [1] - 8:8 PREMIER [1] - 1:24 prepared [1] - 11:6 present [2] - 2:9, 8:7 prices [1] - 6:10 principal [1] - 8:3 proceeded [1] - 6:18 proceeding [2] - 10:21, 11:8 PROCEEDINGS [1] - 1:6 Proceedings [1] - 1:12 produced [1] - 11:6 Professional [2] - 1:14, 11:4 project [4] - 5:24, 6:3, 7:1, 9:19 projects [1] - 8:25 Public [3] - 1:15, 11:4, 11:17 put [4] - 6:5, 9:2, 9:10, 9:16</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">S</p> <p>seal [1] - 11:15 second [6] - 4:19, 4:20, 5:12, 5:13, 9:21, 10:10 seconded [4] - 4:21, 5:14, 9:22, 10:11 seeing [3] - 5:9, 6:10, 9:15 seek [1] - 10:7 seem [1] - 9:2 September [1] - 6:5 set [1] - 11:14 Shannon [3] - 1:13, 11:4, 11:17 short [1] - 3:25 short-term [1] - 3:25 signify [2] - 4:22, 5:15 signs [1] - 9:10 simply [1] - 8:11 site [2] - 8:11, 8:18</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">T</p> <p>tab [1] - 6:20 table [1] - 9:16 term [1] - 3:25 testimony [2] - 11:5, 11:7 thinking [1] - 6:9 three [1] - 10:5 tightened [1] - 9:2 today [2] - 3:3, 4:1 today's [1] - 10:7 traffic [7] - 7:20, 7:25, 8:5, 8:12, 9:1, 9:5, 9:10 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 1:6 Transcript [1] - 1:12 Transcription [1] - 11:6 transcription [1] - 11:7 true [1] - 11:7 Trumbull [3] - 2:10, 3:18, 4:13 trustee [2] - 3:19, 3:20 Tuesday [1] - 1:17 two [2] - 6:13, 8:3</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">M</p> <p>magnitudes [1] - 6:24 mail [1] - 3:23 Main [1] - 1:16 maintain [2] - 9:5, 9:10 maintenance [4] - 7:20, 8:5, 8:12, 9:1 means [1] - 11:6 meeting [4] - 3:2, 5:5, 8:8, 10:7 MEETING [1] - 1:6 meetings [1] - 4:7 member [1] - 4:16 middle [1] - 6:22 might [1] - 4:1 million [2] - 6:11, 7:4 minutes [3] - 5:4, 5:7, 5:21 mobilization [3] -</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">O</p> <p>observe [1] - 4:6 obviously [1] - 7:10 OF [4] - 1:1, 1:5, 1:6, 11:2</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Q</p> <p>qualified [1] - 11:5 questions [2] - 7:19, 9:12 quite [1] - 7:5</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">U</p> <p>unable [1] - 3:14 under [4] - 7:9, 7:20, 7:22, 11:13 undersigned [1] - 1:13 up [4] - 7:3, 7:18, 9:3, 9:10</p>	

V

Valentine's ^[1] - 3:4
valley ^[1] - 7:24
variance ^[1] - 7:22
vary ^[1] - 8:13

W

watch ^[1] - 4:6
Wayne ^[3] - 2:4, 3:11,
 10:1
WHEREOF ^[1] - 11:14
wide ^[1] - 7:21
Wilder ^[1] - 4:17
wilder ^[1] - 3:13
wildly ^[1] - 8:13
Wise ^[3] - 5:23, 7:15,
 9:18
WITNESS ^[1] - 11:14
won ^[2] - 8:17, 9:3
word ^[1] - 8:24
www.
premierreporters.
com ^[1] - 1:25

Y

year ^[1] - 7:7
years ^[1] - 7:2

Z

zero ^[1] - 10:5